

A Comparative Study of the Discipline Management of Head Teachers of Secondary Schools

Abstract

This quantitative study compares the performance of directly appointed and promoted head teachers of public secondary schools of the Punjab regarding discipline management. Fifty public secondary schools of district Sargodha were selected as sample of the study. A 5-point Likert-type questionnaire was developed for data collection purpose regarding nine important dimensions of disciplinary responsibilities, i.e., monitoring punctuality, supervision of morning assembly, observing regularity, actions taken in case of absenteeism, assurance of proper uniform for students, control of disturbance in school, observance of movement rules, supervision of academic tasks and conflict resolution.. The data was collected through survey technique, from head teachers of selected schools. The findings drawn from analysis revealed that promoted head teachers perform their duties more efficiently than directly appointed head teachers.

Key words: *Direct Appointment, Promotion, Disciplinary Responsibilities, Secondary Schools, Head Teachers*

INTRODUCTION

In an educational institution, head teachers play a fundamental role in the qualitative and quantitative improvement of educational system to meet the challenges of modern era and constraints of the changing world. Andre, Anatolo and Gerard (2008) viewed head teachers of a secondary school as the head of a complex organization and perceived it as "a public entity called upon to satisfy at any given time the interest of the community (p.11).

Prof. Dr. Bushra Iqbal Chohan

Prof. of Education, Government College for Women, Zafar ul Haq Road,
Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

Email: bushrachohan@hotmail.com

Asia Bibi

Situation Analysis in Pakistan

The formal education system in Pakistan is derived from the model of the education system in industrialized Britain. The transplantation of the education model from an industrialized country into an agrarian society has been one of the main reasons for the restrictive progress of education in Pakistan. Since independence, various efforts have been made by the government for the development of the secondary education system in accordance with national, social, ideological and economic needs of the province. The public sector has provided access to schools and better educational facilities to poor people (World Bank, 2007). In this regard, numerous policies for improvement of administration of public schools in the province have been formulated. The management of the entire system of secondary education and all matters related to secondary education such as recruitment of teachers and head teachers are the responsibility of provincial governments. Every province has made policies in this regard with consultation of the federal ministry. For the purpose of improving administration at secondary level, "Government of the Punjab constituted the provincial selection board **and** the departmental promotion committee for making selection to various posts in pursuance of the provisions of rules 4 of the Punjab Civil Servants rules." (Estacode, 2005, p.54). Besides this, Punjab Public Service Commission is vested with the responsibility of making direct recruitment for the posts of head teachers of public secondary schools running under the Government of Punjab.

The post of head teacher of a public secondary school is filled through either departmental promotion procedure or by direct selection process. Keeping in view the leading role of secondary school head teachers, the Government of the Punjab has devoted more attention towards improvement in policies of direct appointment and in service promotion of head teachers. The promoted head teachers are working in grades 17, 18, 19 and 20, in public schools of the Punjab province, whereas the directly appointed head teachers are selected in grades 17 and 18. There is no difference in performing administrative responsibilities of head teachers working in these grades. The Punjab government policy states that only those persons are to be selected through these procedures that have deep companionship and better professional ability towards administrative responsibilities. The in-service promotion and direct appointment procedure offer a chance to management in public secondary schools. For the post of a head teacher in BS-20 and 19, all vacancies are filled through promotion, and for BS-18, 75% of the total vacancies are filled through promotion whereas remaining 25% are filled through direct appointment. Similarly for the post of head teacher of BS-17, 67% of the total vacancies are filled through

departmental promotion, and remaining 33% posts are filled through direct appointment. The process of direct appointment is carried out through an autonomous body, called the Punjab Public Service Commission. The head teachers appointed through both procedures have their own qualities. The directly appointed head teachers are thought to be younger, educated, active and motivated, whereas the promoted head teachers come with considerable professional experience and thus are considered to be more expert in handling complex situations in the school environment. On the other hand, directly appointed head teachers do not have much experience to handle complex situations. Though they have the latest knowledge of different administrative policies that are in practice around the globe, in the Pakistani context they may have inadequate knowledge to handle complex situations. The promoted head teachers also may not perform well because of their growing age factor and low educational qualifications as they come up through the promotion process from the comparatively low grade job of school teacher. They do not have the latest knowledge of administrative practices in other education systems of developing and developed countries and rely on their own experiences as teachers. Administration is very different from teaching and a good teacher may not perform as a good administrator.

On the basis of this discussion, it is concluded that a comparison of administration abilities of promoted and directly appointed head teachers requires further exploration. The administration phenomenon in public secondary schools should be discussed and studied especially in the context of Pakistani education system where education system is already facing multiple problems. Research studies need to be conducted to discuss in detail the effectiveness of promotion or direct appointment procedures of appointment of head teachers. Keeping all this in mind, the present study is designed to conduct a comparison of the performance of head teachers coming through both procedures. Due to limited time and resources, it was not possible to compare all administrative responsibilities of both types of head teachers, so, the study was delimited to comparing the disciplinary responsibilities of these two types of head teachers because disciplinary responsibilities are an important component of school administration.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The study employed quantitative approach of research in order to test the null hypotheses of the study. The data was collected through survey technique, with the help of a questionnaire constructed for head teachers of public secondary schools. A 5-point Likert type questionnaire comprising 32 items was developed locally for data collection in the light of existing literature on discipline management in schools

(Sowell, 2012, Kiggundu. 2009, Burden, 1995). The content for this questionnaire was based on nine dimensions of disciplinary responsibilities of head teachers of secondary schools. i.e. monitoring punctuality, supervision of morning assembly, observing regularity, actions taken in case of absenteeism, assurance of proper uniform for students, control of disturbance in school, observance of movement rules, supervision of academic tasks and conflict resolution. During the development of this questionnaire, three experienced teachers (not included in the sample) reviewed it and modifications were made based on their suggestions. The questionnaire was further modified based on some basic theoretical concepts that emerged after two pilot interviews were analyzed. Amendments proposed by these respondents have been used to improve the questionnaire. The questionnaire was divided into themed sections so that the information obtained from each participant (teacher) could be regulated to some extent. These nine dimensions were derived mainly by checking the difficulty level, sequence of the statements, and pattern of the questionnaire and minor changes in items were advised. A demographic section was attached with the questionnaire of head teachers, secondary school teachers and secondary grade students for getting required information. This information consisted of gender, qualification, years of experience, school category, school sector for head teachers. After careful revision of the statements of the questionnaire by the experts and replacement of weak items, the questionnaire was administered for pilot testing in order to test the reliability of the questionnaire. Ten schools were randomly selected for pilot testing, of which five were running under the administration of promoted head teachers' school and the other five from directly appointed head teachers' schools. Cronbach's Alfa reliability of the questionnaire was measured by using SPSS 13 and reliability level of 0.78 was attained. The final version of questionnaire was then approved by the advisory committee for large scale data collection.

Sample of the Study

By employing convenience sampling technique, the sample for this study was selected from public secondary schools of the Sargodha district. The total population of head teachers of public secondary schools of district Sargodha is 268 (Government of the Punjab, 2013). Of the entire population of district Sargodha, fifty (50) public secondary schools (approximately 20%) were selected for data collection purposes. The sample included both promoted (25) and directly appointed (25) head teachers. Of the 25 promoted head teachers, 14 (56%) were male and 11 (44%) were female. Similarly, of the 25 head teachers, 17 (68%) were male and 08 (32%) were female. The academic qualification of sample head teachers is described as follows:

Table 1*Academic Qualification of the sample head teachers (n=50)*

Qualification	Promoted		Directly Appointed	
	Male	Female	Male	Female
MPhil	02	-	01	-
M.A	05	09	12	08
MSc	08	01	04	-

Table 1 describes the details of academic qualifications of the sample head teachers. Among promoted head teachers, 02 males held the degree of Master of Philosophy, 05 males and 09 females held the degree of Master of Arts, whereas 08 males and 01 female head teacher held the degree of Master of Science. On the other hand, only 01 directly appointed male head teacher held the degree of Master of Philosophy, 12 males and 08 females held the degree of Master of Arts, whereas 04 male head teachers held the degree of Master of Science. On the whole, 50 % of the sample was related to the schools running under the supervision of promoted head teachers and remaining 50 % sample comprised of schools running under directly appointed head teachers' administration.

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

Descriptive analysis was performed with the entire data in order to get the total response value by taking average response of each item of the questionnaire with respect to nine dimensions of disciplinary responsibilities. The results of the descriptive analysis are as below:

Monitoring Punctuality as Disciplinary Responsibility

The first dimension of disciplinary responsibilities of head teacher was "monitoring punctuality". Rumberger, (2005) stated that "at the high school level, school effectiveness can be measured by the regularity of the students", (p.4). Moreover, Kiggundu (2009) also revealed that "if head teachers are not punctual at their schools at times and do much delegation of their duties to their deputies who lack managerial skills of solving conflicts among students (p.47). Monitoring of punctuality was assessed by five items related to observance of school timings by the head teacher, observance of punctuality of the teachers, observance of punctuality of the students, issuance of warnings to late comer teachers, and issuance of warnings to late comer students. The descriptive analysis of the responses of head

teachers, regarding "monitoring punctuality as a disciplinary responsibility" is summarized as below.

Table 2

Comparison of "Monitoring Punctuality as a disciplinary responsibility" between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (N=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	response value
(Total)						
Promoted	47.6		29.4	5.6	-	-
82.6						
Directly Appointed	41.6		27.6	6.0	2.4	-
77.6						

Table 2 presents the situation analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding their disciplinary responsibilities of monitoring punctuality. The cumulative response value of both directly appointed and promoted head teachers presented in Table 5 revealed that promoted head teachers were more punctual than directly appointed one (The total response value was 82.6 for promoted and 77.6 for directly selected head teachers).

Supervision of Morning Assembly as a disciplinary responsibility

The second dimension of disciplinary responsibilities was "supervision of morning assembly" which was assessed by three items related to supervision of morning assembly by the head teacher, supervision of teacher's presence in the morning assembly, students' presence is ensured in morning assembly by the head teacher. The descriptive analysis of the responses of head teachers, regarding "supervision of morning assembly as a disciplinary responsibility" is summarized as below.

Table 3

Comparison of "supervision of morning assembly by the head teacher, between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
(Total)						
Promoted		52.0	30.9	3.2	-	86.1
Directly Appointed	53.2	24.0		7.2	-	84.4

Table 3 presents the situation analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding their disciplinary responsibilities of supervision of morning assembly. The cumulative response value of both directly selected and promoted head teachers presented in Table 6 revealed that promoted head teachers were more duty-conscious than directly appointed head teachers, however, the difference is minimal. (The total response value was 86.1 for promoted and 84.4 for directly selected head teachers).

Observance of regularity as a disciplinary responsibility

The third dimension of disciplinary responsibilities was "observance of regularity" which was assessed by four items, regular attendance by the students is observed by the respective head teacher, taking regular classes by the teachers is ensured by the head teacher, leave is granted to the teachers according to rules, leave is granted to the students according to rules and is monitored by the respective head teacher. The descriptive analysis of the responses of all four items regarding "observing regularity" is summarized as below.

Table 4

Observance of regularity as a disciplinary responsibility by the head teacher, between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
(Total)						
Promoted	50	20.25	6.5	1.00	-	80.75
Directly Appointed	44	18	7.5	4.75	-	74.25

Table 4 communicated the situation analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding observance of regularity as a disciplinary responsibility. The cumulative response value of both directly selected and promoted head teachers presented in Table 7 revealed that promoted head teachers monitored regularity of their staff and students more actively than directly appointed head teachers, however this difference is minimal. (The total response value 80.75 for promoted and 74.25 for directly selected head teachers).

"Action Taken in case of Absenteeism" by the Head Teacher

The fourth dimension of disciplinary responsibilities was "Action Taken in case of Absenteeism by the Head Teacher". Bradley and Lenton (2007) concluded in their study that absenteeism effected school effectiveness and discipline management, which was assessed by four items; namely, teachers' absenteeism is strictly monitored by head teacher, alternate arrangements for students are made in case of teachers' absence, students, absenteeism is strictly monitored, parents are informed in case of students' absenteeism. The descriptive analysis of the responses of each category regarding "Action Taken in case of Absenteeism as a disciplinary responsibility" is summarized as below.

Table 5

'Action Taken in Case of Absenteeism, as a disciplinary responsibility by the head teacher' between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
<u>(Total)</u>						
Promoted	70	19.5	1.5	.25	-	91.25
Directly Appointed	64	16.5	5.5	.75	-	86.75

Table 5 presents the situational analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding action taken in case of absenteeism of students and teachers as a disciplinary responsibility. The cumulative response presented the situation of promoted head teachers in connection with their schools' retention, of students and teachers in the workplace, are mostly aware and monitor teachers' absenteeism more strictly than the directly appointed. (The total response value was 91.25 for promoted and 86.75 for directly appointed head teachers).

Assurance of Proper Uniform for Students by the Head Teacher

The fifth dimension of disciplinary responsibilities was "assurance of proper uniform for students". Sowell, (2012) was of the view that "school uniform policies are designed to foster student outcomes (p.1). This dimension was assessed by three items: students' presence in full school uniform is ensured by head teacher, students coming without uniform are fined, and students coming in neat and clean uniform were appreciated in morning assembly by head teachers. The descriptive analysis of the responses of all items regarding "students' uniform" is summarized separately below.

Table 6

Comparison of Assurance of Proper Uniform for students between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
<u>(Total)</u>						
Promoted	54.4	17	5.2	3	-	79.6
Directly Appointed	48.0	21	4.6	3.6		77.2

Table 6 presents the situational analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding assurance of proper uniform for students as a disciplinary responsibility. Table 9 revealed cumulative response and presented the situation of promoted head teachers in connection with proper uniform of their students more vigilantly than the directly appointed, however this difference is minimal. (The total response value 79.6 for promoted and 77.2 for directly appointed head teachers).

Management of Control of Disturbance in School by the Head Teacher

The sixth dimension of disciplinary responsibilities "management control of disturbance in school" Burden (1995) explained in these words: "misbehavior creates disruptions in the flow of class room activities, but not every infraction of a rule is necessarily misbehavior" (p.15). For this reason disturbance in school needs to be seen as "action in context and requires considerable interpretation when decisions are made about the misbehavior" (Burden, 1995, p.15). Management of control of disturbance was assessed by three items, disturbance by the students in the classes is observed by the head teachers, violation of discipline rules in the presence of teachers is observed and peaceful learning environment is ensured. The

descriptive analysis of the responses of all items regarding "control of disturbance" is summarized here:

Table 7

Comparison of observance of control of disturbance in schools, between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
<u>(Total)</u>						
Promoted	40	16	18.6	0.6	-	75.2
Directly Appointed	29.3	19	15.3	3.6	-	67.2

Table 7 presented the perceptions of head teachers regarding control of disturbance in school as a disciplinary responsibility of the head teachers. Table 10 revealed cumulative response and presented the situation of promoted head teachers in connection with control of disturbance in schools more vigilantly than directly appointed head teachers. (The total response value 75.2 for promoted and 67.2 for directly appointed head teachers).

Observance of Movement Rules by the Head Teacher

The seventh dimension of disciplinary responsibilities "observance of movement rules" was assessed by three items: in time presence of teachers in the classes is ensured by the head teachers, students leave the class with the teacher's permission; entry on movement is registered in case the short leave of teacher is ensured by the head teachers. The descriptive analysis of the responses of all items regarding "observance of movement rules" is summarized here:

Table 8

Comparison of Observance of movement rules as a disciplinary responsibility by the Head Teacher, between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
<u>(Total)</u>						
Promoted	56.0	27	2.6	0.6	-	86.2
Directly Appointed	50.6	23	2.0	2.0	-	77.6

Table 8 presents the situation analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding observance of movement rules as a disciplinary responsibility. The cumulative responses of head teachers presented in Table 11 revealed that promoted head teachers ensured retention of their staff and students in the workplace more attentively than directly appointed head teachers. (The total response value 86.2 for promoted and 77.6 for directly appointed head teachers).

"Checking of Academic Tasks Assigned to Students and Teachers" as a disciplinary responsibility by the Head Teacher

The eighth dimension "checking of academic tasks assigned to students and teachers" as a disciplinary responsibilities, was assessed by four items: students' academic tasks are monitored by head teacher, teachers' supervision of students' academic tasks is ensured, students' academic tasks are countersigned by head teachers and teachers' daily lesson plans are regularly monitored by head teacher. The descriptive analysis of the responses of all items regarding "academic tasks" is summarized here:

Table 9

Comparison of "Check Academic Tasks Assigned to Students and teachers by the Head Teacher" between promoted and directly appointed head teachers, with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
<u>(Total)</u>						
Promoted	28	34.5	9.5	1.25	-	73.2
Directly Appointed	27	34.5	9.4	1.0	-	71.9

Table 9 present the situation analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding check academic tasks assigned to students and teachers. The cumulative responses of head teachers presented in Table 12 revealed that promoted head teachers ensured that academic tasks assigned their staff and students attentively like the directly appointed head teachers. There is no significant difference between the two categories. (The total response value 73.2 for promoted and 71.9 for directly appointed head teachers).

“Conflict resolution among teachers and students” by the head teacher

The ninth dimension of disciplinary responsibilities "conflict resolution among teachers and students" which was assessed by three items: conflicts among teachers are resolved successfully, major conflicts among students are resolved by head teachers and minor conflicts among students are resolved by the teachers. The descriptive analysis of the responses of all items regarding “conflict resolution among teachers and students” is summarized below:

Table 10

Comparison of “Resolution of Conflicts among Teachers and Students” between promoted and directly appointed head teachers' with respect to the responses of head teachers (n=50)

Category	Always	Often	Sometimes	Rare	Never	Response Value
<u>(Total)</u>						
Promoted	50.4	27.9	8.6	0.6	-	87.5
Directly appointed	32.0	27.9	7.2	4.3	-	71.5

Table 10 shows the situation analysis of the perceptions of head teachers regarding resolution of conflicts among teachers and students. The cumulative responses of head teachers presented in Table 13 revealed that promoted head teachers resolved conflicts of staff and students more successfully than directly appointed head teachers. There is significant difference between them by virtue of the experienced ability of promoted head teachers. (The total response value 87.5 for promoted and 71.5 for directly appointed head teachers).

This quantitative study was designed to compare the performance of promoted head teachers and directly appointed head teachers of public secondary schools of the Punjab regarding disciplinary responsibilities. By employing convenient sampling technique, fifty public secondary schools of district Sargodha were selected as sample of the study. The sample presents a variety of responses and trends. Nine dimensions of disciplinary responsibilities were assessed through thirty two items, and a total of nine tables of responses were tabulated descriptively. Of these twenty responses revealed that the performance of promoted head teachers was better than directly appointed head teachers. The remaining seven responses inclined towards directly appointed head teachers with minor difference. However, the overall trend

revealed through descriptive analysis shows that the performance of promoted head teachers was better than directly appointed head teachers.

Limitations of the Study

The findings related to the head teachers' sample revealed that there is no significant difference between the performance of both types of head teachers, This difference in findings draws the researcher's attention towards the possibility of existence of some bias in the responses of head teachers given that the survey relied on perceptions. One reason could be that both categories of head teachers wanted to portray themselves as the best discipline managers. The bias in self-representation of head teachers may have affected the findings of the study since the findings related to head teachers did not reveal significant difference of performance between the two types. The second limitation of the study is related to the sample of the study. Due to limited time and resources, the sample of the study was selected from public secondary schools of Sargodha district through convenience sampling technique, which affects the generalizability of the findings. Thus the findings of this study may not be generalized to the public secondary schools of other districts of the Pun jab.

The third limitation of this study was non availability of literature review. As this was the very first study of its nature in Pakistani context, it could not be validated by the results of other related studies.

Suggestions for further research

The present study is an important step towards researching about the discipline factor in different administrative responsibilities of secondary school head teachers. Since the parameters of the study were limited, other areas that may be explored are: maintenance of official records, utilization of financial and human resources, organization of parents' teachers committees and relations with related communities.

REFERENCES

- Andre, G. Aatolo, N. & Gerard, R. (2008) School Management, Administration of Secondary schools. Approved by MINEDUC School Management Kigali. 1-60
- Bradley, S. & Lenton, P. (2007) Dropping out of post compulsory education in the UK: An analysis of determinants and outcomes..299-328. *Journal of Population Economics*, 20 (2).
- Burden, P.R. (1995). *Classroom Management and Discipline*. Longman publishers USA.
- Government of the Punjab. (2013).transfer policy. Retrieved from www.punjabshooleducation.com on 6.6.2013
- Government of the Punjab. (2005). Punjab Estacode volume-1-11
- Government of the Punjab (2004). Dastro -ul- amal. Education Department Government of the Punjab. Retrieved from www.punjabshooleducation.com on 6.8.2013
- Kiggundu. H (2009) *The Influence of Discipline Management by Head Teachers in Selected Private Schools of Busiro County in Wakiso*. (an unpublished Master thesis)
- Rumberger,R.W.(2005) Test Scores, Dropout Rates, and Transfer Rates as Alternative Indicators of High School Performance . *American Educational Research Journal* 42,(1).
- Sowell, R. E.(2012). The relationship of School Uniforms to Student Attendance, Achievement, and Discipline. *Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 2 (23)
- World Bank. (2007). *Pakistan, Learning and Educational Achievements in The Punjab Schools (LEAPS): Insights to Inform the Education Policy Debate*. Washington DC. USA.